Contents lists available at [ScienceDirect](www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/10499644)

Biological Control

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/ybcon

Comparative life tables of *Trissolcus japonicus* and *Trissolcus mitsukurii*, egg parasitoids of *Halyomorpha halys*

Alberto Mele * , Dinvesh Sai Avanigadda , Enrico Ceccato , Gabriel Bamidele Olawuyi , Filippo Simoni , Carlo Duso , Davide Scaccini , Alberto Pozzebon *

Department of Agronomy, Food, Natural Resources, Animals and Environment, University of Padua, Viale dell'Universita ` *16, Legnaro, PD, Italy*

HIGHLIGHTS GRAPHICAL ABSTRACT

- *Trissolcus japonicus* has a greater longevity than *T. mitsukurii.*
- *Trissolcus japonicus* has a higher net reproductive rate than *T. mitsukurii* at 26 and 31 ◦C.
- The intrinsic rate of increase of *T. mitsukurii* at 21 ◦C is higher compared to *T. japonicus.*
- *Trissolcus mitsukurii* has a higher fitness at a lower range of temperatures than *T. japonicus.*
- *Trissolcus japonicus* demonstrated higher performance as Biological Control Agent.

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Classical biological control Invasive species Egg parasitoids Development rate Thermal biology

Temperature °C

ABSTRACT

Trissolcus japonicus (Ashmead) (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae) and *Trissolcus mitsukurii* (Ashmead) (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae) are Asian egg parasitoids that are considered important natural enemies of the brown marmorated stink bug *Halyomorpha halys* (Stål) (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae). These species are expanding their geographic distribution outside their native area, which suggests investigating their adaptability to environmental conditions. In a laboratory experiment, we investigated the life table parameters of these two egg parasitoid species under four constant temperatures, i.e., 16, 21, 26 and 31 ◦C. Results showed that the longevity of *T. japonicus* was higher than that of *T. mitsukurii* at all temperatures considered. The net reproductive rate (*Ro*) of *T. japonicus* was higher than that of *T. mitsukurii* at 26 and 31 ◦C. However, the intrinsic rate of increase (*rm*) at 26 and 31 ◦C was similar between the two species, and at 21 ◦C, *T. mitsukurii* exhibited a higher intrinsic and finite rate of increase. The two species complete their development at 16 ℃, but with the lowest performances. Results suggest a higher increase of *T. mitsukurii* population when mean temperatures are equal to 21 ◦C, while the population increase of *T. japonicus* is expected to be favoured at higher temperatures.

* Corresponding authors.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2024.105548>

Available online 1 June 2024 Received 6 February 2024; Received in revised form 18 March 2024; Accepted 31 May 2024

1049-9644/© 2024 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Inc. This is an open access article under the CC BY license(<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

E-mail addresses: alberto.mele@unipd.it (A. Mele), alberto.pozzebon@unipd.it (A. Pozzebon).

1. Introduction

Knowledge of the effects of temperatures on natural enemy biodemography is important for understanding host-parasitoid dynamics and impact on pest regulation ([Bellows et al., 1992; Carey, 2001](#page-6-0)). Thus, life table construction is a milestone in evaluating natural enemies population performances on economically important pests [\(Van Drie](#page-8-0)[sche and Bellows, 1996\)](#page-8-0).

In the past two decades, *Halyomorpha halys* (Stål) (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) has become an important pest worldwide. Native to Asia, it spread to many countries following human pathways; it was first recorded in Pennsylvania in 1996 [\(Hoebeke and Carter, 2003](#page-7-0)), then it has spread throughout the United States, Canada [\(Fogain and Graff,](#page-6-0) [2011; Leskey and Nielsen, 2018](#page-6-0)) and South America [\(Faúndez and](#page-6-0) [Rider, 2017\)](#page-6-0). In Europe, *H. halys* was first detected in Switzerland in 2007 [\(Wermelinger et al., 2008\)](#page-8-0), and later, it spread to almost all European countries, where the dynamics of infestation are established on a landscape scale ([Laterza et al., 2023; Park et al., 2023; Tamburini et al.,](#page-7-0) [2023\)](#page-7-0).

Halyomorpha halys is a highly polyphagous insect, feeding on more than 170 species of crop and non-crop plants ([Leskey and Nielsen,](#page-7-0) [2018\)](#page-7-0). Like other heteropterans, *H. halys* is a piercing-sucking insect that can feed on different plant organs [\(Lee et al., 2013; Scaccini and Poz](#page-7-0)[zebon, 2021](#page-7-0)) but prefers fruit structures. Crop plants mostly damaged are fruit crops such as apple, pear, peach, kiwifruit and cherry [\(For](#page-6-0)[nasiero et al., 2023; Francati et al., 2021; Leskey and Nielsen, 2018;](#page-6-0) [Maistrello et al., 2017; Moore et al., 2019\)](#page-6-0), but also nut crops such as hazelnut, almond, walnut and pistachio [\(Bosco et al., 2018; Stahl et al.,](#page-6-0) [2021, 2020](#page-6-0)) and open field crops such as maize and soybean ([Cissel](#page-6-0) [et al., 2015; Nielsen et al., 2011](#page-6-0)).

Chemical control against *H. halys* relies mainly on broad-spectrum insecticides, even though they are ineffective in controlling this pest ([Kuhar and Kamminga, 2017\)](#page-7-0). Among sustainable strategies for control of this pest, biological control based on Scelionidae egg parasitoids is seen as the most promising ([Gutierrez et al., 2023; Lee et al., 2013](#page-6-0)). Scelionid wasps are specialised in egg parasitism of insects: they have high searching abilities and reproductive rates, positive host density responsiveness, and usually synchrony with the host [\(Orr, 1988](#page-7-0)). Two scelionid egg parasitoids were considered the most effective natural enemies of *H. halys* in Asia, *Trissolcus japonicus* (Ashmead) (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae) and *Trissolcus mitsukurii* (Ashmead) (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae). In Asia, the most common biological control agent of *H. halys* is *T. japonicus*, which showed 50–80 % of parasitism both in China and Japan [\(Avila et al., 2021; Kamiyama et al., 2021; Zhang et al.,](#page-6-0) [2017\)](#page-6-0). While *T. japonicus* is reported to be present both in China and Japan, *T. mitsukurii* has been recorded to parasitise *H. halys* in Japan, with performances comparable to those of *T. japonicus* [\(Kamiyama et al.,](#page-7-0) [2021; Lee et al., 2013](#page-7-0)). Outside its native range, *T. japonicas* was first detected in North America in 2014 [\(Talamas et al., 2015\)](#page-8-0) and in Canada in 2017 ([Gariepy and Talamas, 2019\)](#page-6-0). In Europe, *T. japonicus* was detected in Switzerland in 2017 ([Stahl et al., 2019\)](#page-8-0), in Italy in 2018 ([Sabbatini Peverieri et al., 2018](#page-7-0)), and in Germany in 2020 ([Dieckhoff](#page-6-0) [et al., 2021](#page-6-0)). Instead, adventive populations of *T. mitsukurii* were found in Italy from 2016 [\(Scaccini et al., 2020](#page-7-0)) and later on in Slovenia [\(Rot](#page-7-0) [et al., 2021](#page-7-0)) and France [\(Bout et al., 2021\)](#page-6-0). In invaded areas, both parasitoids are expanding their geographic range and increasing their impact on the host ([Abram et al., 2019; Hedstrom et al., 2017; Kaser](#page-6-0) [et al., 2018; Mele et al., 2022; Zapponi et al., 2021](#page-6-0)). However, hyperparasitoids that develop on primary parasitoid species are adding complexity to the host-parasitoid system ([Giovannini et al., 2021a; Mele](#page-6-0) [et al., 2021; Moraglio et al., 2020; Sabbatini Peverieri et al., 2019;](#page-6-0) [Scaccini et al., 2020\)](#page-6-0).

Both *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* have been considered for classical and augmentative biological control strategies. Indeed, many aspects of the biology ([Malek et al., 2021; McIntosh et al., 2020; Sabbatini](#page-7-0) [Peverieri et al., 2020; Scala et al., 2022\)](#page-7-0) and the non-target effects of

these two species have recently been investigated [\(Giovannini et al.,](#page-6-0) [2021b; Haye et al., 2020; Hedstrom et al., 2017; Rondoni et al., 2022](#page-6-0)). However, temperature-related development of these two egg parasitoid species has not been studied in detail. In this work, *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* were reared in laboratory conditions using *H. halys* eggs as host and under four constant temperatures to investigate the life-history traits of these two important biological control agents.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Insect rearing

Laboratory colonies of *H. halys*, *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* were established in 2020 from field-collected insects in Veneto region, northeastern Italy. Stink bugs were reared at 26 ± 2 °C, 60 ± 10 % RH, and 16:8 (L:D) photoperiod in insect cages (30 \times 30 \times 50 cm) with green bean plants (*Phaseolus vulgaris*), and sunflower seeds (*Helianthus annuus*), apple (*Malus domestica*) and kiwi (*Actinidia chinensis*) fruits added as additional food sources. Water was provided through a wetted cotton ball. Egg masses were collected and preserved at 6 ◦C for no more than one month before being used in this study ([Bittau et al., 2021;](#page-6-0) [Wong et al., 2021](#page-6-0)). *Trissolcus* colonies were maintained on *H. halys* egg masses and reared at 26 ± 1 °C, 60 ± 10 % RH, and photoperiod 16:8 (L: D).

2.2. Experimental design

To run the experiment, 40 newly-emerged (*<*1 day-old) couples of each parasitoid species were isolated. Each couple was placed in a centrifuge tube, with a netted cap for ventilation and honey provided as a food source, renewed every other day. Parasitoid couples were placed at 16, 21, 26, or 31 \pm 1 °C in four different climatic chambers with a relative humidity of 60 ± 10 % and photoperiod 16:8 (L:D). Ten couples of *T. mitsukurii* and ten of *T. japonicus* were placed in each chamber. A single fresh *H. halys* egg mass was supplied daily to each couple until the death of the female parasitoid. Parasitoids were left ovipositing for 24 h and then parasitised egg masses were moved to another centrifuge tube, labelled and kept in the same climatic chamber where they were parasitised. Parasitoid couples and parasitised egg masses were observed daily to check parasitoid emergence and survivorship.

Adult parasitoids from parasitised *H. halys* egg masses were counted and sexed. Moreover, egg dissection was performed under a stereomicroscope (Stemi 508, Carl Zeiss Microscopy GmbH, Jena, Germany) to count parasitoids that possibly failed to develop to the adult stage.

2.3. Data analysis

Female and male survivorships were compared with Kaplan-Meier Survival Analysis with Log-rank test by using LIFETEST procedure of SAS software ver. 9.4 [\(SAS Institute Inc., 2016](#page-7-0)). The mean number of eggs (i.e., the sum of emerged parasitoids and parasitoids that failed to emerge) produced by each female, the mean number of eggs per day, the progeny sex ratio and the progeny survival ratio were analysed with a two-way ANOVA and Tukey post-hoc test ($\alpha = 0.05$), with temperature, parasitoid species and their interaction considered as independent variables. To run the ANOVA, the GLM procedure of SAS software ver. 9.4 ([SAS Institute Inc., 2016\)](#page-7-0) was used, and ANOVA assumptions were checked before analysis. To follow normality assumptions, progeny sex ratio and progeny survival ratio were angular transformed (i.e., the arcsine of the square root of the ratio) before analysis. Male and female development times from egg to emergence of the adult were analysed with a generalized linear model (α = 0.05) using GENMOD procedure of SAS software ver. 9.4 (SAS Institute Inc.).

The development time required from egg to adult was used to understand the upper and lower thermal limits. The relationship between development rate (1/days) and temperature were fitted with both a

Table 1

Definitions and formulae for life table parameters ([Maia et al., 2000\)](#page-7-0).

Parameter		Definition	Formula
\boldsymbol{x}		Age interval in days	
m_{x}	Age-specific	The average offspring females per	
	fecundity	female in age x	
l,	Age-specific	Proportion of females surviving to	
	survival	start of the age x	
Ro	Net reproductive	The mean offspring females per	$\sum l_{x} \times m_{x}$
	rate	female, during the entire oviposition	
		period	
r_m	Intrinsic rate of	Rate of natural increase in closed	$\sum e^{-rx} \times l_x \times$
	increase	population	$m_{\rm r}=1$
λ	Finite rate of	Rate of increase per unit time per	ρ^{r_m}
	increase	individual	
T	Generation time	Mean time span between the birth of	Ln(Ro)
		individuals of a generation and	r_m
		that of the next generation	
DT	Doubling time	Time span necessary for doubling	Ln(2)
		the initial population	r_m

linear ([Campbell et al., 1974\)](#page-6-0) and non-linear model [\(Lactin et al., 1995](#page-7-0)), since at optimum temperature ranges (as the case of our study), the linear relationship best fits development rate ([Ikemoto and Takai,](#page-7-0) [2000\)](#page-7-0), but cannot estimate the upper thermal limit. To run the models, the "devRate" package ([Rebaudo et al., 2018\)](#page-7-0) implemented in R version 4.1.2 was used [\(R Core Team, 2021\)](#page-7-0).

The following fecundity data were used in the evaluation of life table parameters: net reproductive rate (*Ro*), intrinsic rate of increase (*rm*), finite rate of increase (*λ*), mean generation time (*T*) and doubling time (*DT*) ([Carey, 1993; Maia et al., 2000](#page-6-0)). Parameter symbols, formulae and definitions are summarized in Table 1 and follow [Maia et al. \(2000\).](#page-7-0) Life table parameters were estimated with the Jackknife method proposed by [Meyer et al. \(1986\)](#page-7-0), and multiple comparisons between temperatures

and parasitoid species were done with a two-tailed *t* test ($\alpha = 0.05$) using Jackknife estimates of their respective variances. Analyses were run with the SAS program developed by [Maia et al. \(2000\)](#page-7-0) using SAS software ver. 9.4 ([SAS Institute Inc., 2016](#page-7-0)).

3. Results

The lifespan of *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* varied among the four different temperatures and decreased along with temperature for both males (*T. japonicus*: χ^2 = 46.8432, df = 3, P < 0.0001; *T. mitsukurii*: χ^2 = 49.0932, df = 3, P *<* 0.0001) and females (*T. japonicus*: χ2 = 106.5664, df = 3, P < 0.0001; *T. mitsukurii:* χ^2 = 93.5094, df = 3, P < 0.0001). Females lived the longest at 16 ◦C (*T. japonicus*: 161 days; *T. mitsukurii*: 126 days) and the shortest at 31 ◦C (*T. japonicus*: 31 days; *T. mitsukurii*: 25 days) (Fig. 1). The longevity of males was shorter than females at all the tested temperatures, and male longevity decreased with increasing temperature being the shortest at 31 ◦C (*T. japonicus*: 21 days; *T. mitsukurii*: 15 days) and highest at 16 ◦C (*T. japonicus*: 137 days; *T. mitsukurii*: 120 days). Females of *T. japonicus* had a higher survival

Table 2

Results of the Log-rank test on the differences between *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* males and females survival at 16, 21, 26 and 31 ◦C.

Temperature	Sex	v^2	df	P value
16 °C	F	7.8188	1	0.0052
	М	1.0016	1	0.3169
21 °C	F	16.9255	1	< 0.0001
	М	7.2944	1	0.0069
26 °C	F	7.9769	1	0.0047
	М	6.3414	1	0.0118
31 °C	F	7.9790	1	0.0047
	М	6.4954		0.0108

Fig. 1. Kaplan-Meier survival curves of females of *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* at four constant temperatures.

Fig. 2. Average number of eggs laid by a female of *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* at four constant temperatures.

Table 3

Mean (±S.E.) number of eggs per female, number of eggs per female per day, progeny sex ratio and progeny survival of *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* under four constant temperatures. Different letters indicate significant differences at Tukey test on least square means ($\alpha = 0.05$).

Temperature	Specie	N. of eggs per female		N. of eggs per female per day		Mean sex ratio (f:m)		Mean progeny survival	
16° C	T. japonicus	37.10 ± 3.41	d	$1.75 + 0.16$	e	$0.76 + 0.03$	a	$0.74 + 0.06$	b
Contract Contract	T. mitsukurii	26.20 ± 4.19	d	$1.19 + 0.18$	e	0.82 ± 0.04		0.62 ± 0.07	
21 °C	T. japonicus	$83.50 + 4.81$	bc	$3.43 + 0.53$	d	$0.78 + 0.04$	a	$0.90 + 0.02$	a
	T. mitsukurii	$68.60 + 5.48$	\sim	$2.36 + 0.27$	d	$0.82 + 0.03$		$0.94 + 0.03$	
26 °C	T. japonicus	145.90 ± 8.96	a	7.50 ± 0.41	b	0.63 ± 0.04	b	$0.90 + 0.01$	a
	T. mitsukurii	95.20 ± 6.64	b.	6.30 ± 0.47	bc	$0.54 + 0.04$		0.90 ± 0.02	
31° C	T. japonicus	165.30 ± 11.34	a	11.36 ± 0.86	a	$0.62 + 0.05$	b	$0.91 + 0.02$	a
	T. mitsukurii	73.50 ± 5.70	bc	5.10 ± 0.43		0.72 ± 0.03		0.85 ± 0.02	

probability compared to *T. mitsukurii* at all temperatures tested ([Table 2](#page-2-0); [Fig. 1\)](#page-2-0). Males of *T. japonicus* had a higher survival probability than *T. mitsukurii* at 21, 26 and 31 ◦C, while the survival probability at 16 ◦C did not differ between the two species [\(Table 2;](#page-2-0) Fig. S1).

In total, 1748 egg masses were observed to assess parasitoid fecundity. Both *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* started laying eggs from the first day of their lifespan, and the number eggs laid tended to be highest during the first 1-5 days of the oviposition period (Fig. 2). For all temperatures tested, the daily fecundity of both parasitoid species decreased with increasing age of the females (Fig. 2). The mean number of eggs produced by a female during the total lifespan was different among temperatures and between the two species $(F_{3,71} = 12.87, P < 0.0001;$ Table S1). The total number of eggs laid throughout the lifespan of *T. japonicus* increased with the increase in temperature, being higher at 31 ◦C with respect to 26, 21 and 16 ◦C (Table 3). Instead, *T. mitsukurii* laid more eggs at 26 ◦C with respect to 31, 21 and 16 ◦C (Table 3). At 31 and 26 ◦C, *T. japonicus* laid more eggs in the total lifespan compared to *T. mitsukurii*, while no significant differences between the two species were observed at 21 and 16 $°C$ (Table 3). The mean number of eggs laid

per day by *T. japonicus* was higher compared to those of *T. mitsukurii* at 31 ◦C, while no significant differences between the two species were observed at 26, 21 and 16 ◦C (F3,71 = 16.28, P *<* 0.0001; Tables 3 and S1). The average offspring sex ratio was 68:32 (female:male) for *T. japonicus* and 72:28 (female:male) for *T. mitsukurii*. The sex ratio differed at different temperatures (F3,70 = 11.22, P *<* 0.0001): at 16 and 21 °C, female emergence was higher than that at 26 and 31 °C (Table 3). No differences were found between the two parasitoid species nor the interaction between species and temperature (Table S1). The mean progeny survival was lower at 16 °C than at 21, 26 and 31 °C ($F_{3,71}$ = 12.89, P *<* 0.0001; Table 3), and no differences emerged between the two *Trissolcus* species nor the interaction between parasitoid species and temperature (Table S1).

Life table parameters are shown in [Table 4](#page-4-0). The net reproductive rate (*Ro*) of *T. japonicus* increased from 16 to 26 ◦C and slightly decreased at 31 ◦C, while that of *T. mitsukurii* increased from 16 to 21 ◦C and then decreased with the increase in temperature. The intrinsic (r_m) and finite rate (λ) of increase of both species rose with the increase in temperature, instead the mean generation time (*T*) and doubling time (*DT*) decreased

Table 4

Life table parameters (mean \pm S.E.) of *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* under four constant temperatures. Different letters indicate significant differences at twotailed *t* test ($\alpha = 0.05$). Capital letters refer to significant differences between the two species, while lowercase letters refer to significant differences among temperatures considering the same species.

Species	Parameter	16 °C	21 °C	26 °C	31 °C
Trissolcus	Ro(female/	65.38	$95.96 \pm$	$121.24 \pm$	$116.99 \pm$
japonicus	female)	± 7.24c	9.74 bA	6.25aA	7.34 abA
	r_m (female/	$0.15 \pm$	$0.35 \pm$	$0.85 \pm$	$1.49 \pm$
	female/day)	0.03c	0.03 cB	0.04 _{bA}	0.08 aA
	λ (female/	$1.07 \pm$	$1.41 \pm$	$2.35 \pm$	4.40 \pm
	female/day)	0.09d	0.04 cB	0.09 _{bA}	0.35 aA
	T(days)	17.14	$13.12 \pm$	5.60 \pm	$3.20 \pm$
		± 1.27a	1.14 _{bA}	0.25cA	0.20 dA
	DT (days)	$2.68 \pm$	$1.99 \pm$	$0.81 \pm$	$0.47 \pm$
		0.24a	0.15 _{bA}	0.04 cA	0.02 dA
Trissolcus	Ro(female/	58.65	$86.00 \pm$	$72.77 \pm$	$67.32 \pm$
mitsukurii	female)	± 6.21c	6.56 aA	7.27 abB	4.61 _{bB}
	r_m (female/	$0.18 \pm$	$0.45 \pm$	$0.83 +$	$1.51 \pm$
	female/day)	0.01 _d	0.03cA	0.05 _{bA}	0.07 aA
	λ (female/	$1.06 \pm$	$1.56 \pm$	$2.28 \pm$	4.49 \pm
	female/day)	0.07 _d	0.05cA	0.11 _{bA}	0.35 aA
	T(days)	16.22	$9.84 \pm$	$5.13 \pm$	$2.79 \pm$
		\pm 1.12 a	0.61 _{bB}	0.30cA	0.13 dA
	DT (days)	$2.34 \pm$	$1.53 \pm$	$0.84 \pm$	$0.46 \pm$
		0.33a	0.08 _{bB}	0.05cA	0.02 dA

Table 5

Mean (±S.E.) number of days required for the development of females and males of *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* under four constant temperatures. Different letters indicate significant differences at χ^2 test on least square means ($\alpha = 0.05$).

Sex	Temperature	Species	Developmental time (days)	
Female	16 °C	T. japonicus	33.10 ± 0.05	b
		T. mitsukurii	33.90 ± 0.10	a
	$21\degree$ C	T. japonicus	23.25 ± 0.10	d
		T. mitsukurii	23.90 ± 0.12	c
	26 °C	T. japonicus	11.90 ± 0.14	f
		T. mitsukurii	12.40 ± 0.11	e
	31 °C	T. japonicus	7.78 ± 0.10	g
		T. mitsukurii	8.10 ± 0.12	g
Male	16 °C	T. japonicus	31.10 ± 0.10	a
		T. mitsukurii	31.35 ± 0.15	a
	$21\degree$ C	T. japonicus	22.00 ± 0	b
		T. mitsukurii	22.25 ± 0.10	b
	26 °C	T. japonicus	11.01 ± 0.05	c
		T. mitsukurii	11.25 ± 0.12	c
	31 °C	T. japonicus	7.36 ± 0.10	d
		T. mitsukurii	7.25 ± 0.10	d

with the increase in temperature. The net reproductive rate (*Ro*) at 26 and 31 ◦C was higher for *T. japonicus* with respect to *T. mitsukurii,* while no differences between species were found at the other temperature. At 21 °C, the intrinsic (r_m) and the finite rate of increase (λ) were significantly higher for *T. mitsukurii* respect to that of *T. japonicus,* and these parameters resulted similar between species at the other temperatures. Furthermore, the mean generation time (*T*) and doubling time (*DT*) at 21 ◦C were significantly higher for *T. japonicus* compared to *T. mitsukurii*. No significant differences emerged between the two species at 16 ◦C.

The time for development from egg to adult emergence was different between temperatures, species and sex of the progeny (χ^2 = 83.64, df = 6, P *<* 0.0001; Table S2). The developmental time of both species decreased with increasing temperature (Table 5). Generally, the males of both species emerged one to two days before females independent of temperature (Table 5). Males' developmental time did not differ between *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii*, while females' development time varied between species, with females of *T. mitsukurii* emerging later than

T. japonicus at 16, 21 and 26 ◦C (no differences were observed at 31 ◦C; Table 5).

Linear regression models showed the lower temperature threshold for development as $T_0 = 12.6$ °C for *T. japonicus* (y = 0.0070809x – 0.0890064; $R^2 = 0.71$) and $T_0 = 11.9$ °C for *T. mitsukurii* (y = 0.0061545x – 0.0731682; $R^2 = 0.56$; [Fig. 3\)](#page-5-0). The Lactin-2 model estimated the upper temperature threshold for development as $T_m = 35.2 °C$ $(R^2 = 0.71)$ for *T. japonicus* and $T_m = 33.5$ °C ($R^2 = 0.74$) for *T. mitsukurii* ([Fig. 3\)](#page-5-0).

4. Discussion

The developmental biology of *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* emerging from *H. halys* egg masses suggest different efficacy as biological control agents when facing different temperatures. Understanding the optimal temperature for parasitoid development and reproduction is crucial in studying host-parasitoid interactions, as it enables the implementation of effective biological control programmes in different geographic and climatic areas and also in a climate change scenarios [\(Bellows et al.,](#page-6-0) [1992; Carey, 2001; Furlong and Zalucki, 2017; Jeffs and Lewis, 2013;](#page-6-0) [Klapwijk et al., 2010; Tortorici et al., 2023; Van Driesche and Bellows,](#page-6-0) [1996\)](#page-6-0). Results show a higher survivorship of males and females of *T. japonicus* at all the tested temperatures. Moreover, females of *T. japonicus* lived longer as compared to other *Trissolcus* species such as *T. semistriatus* (Nees von Esenbeck), *T. brochymenae* (Ashmead), *T. basalis* (Wollaston), *T. teretis* (Johnson), *T. urichi* (Crawford) and *T. simoni* (Mayr) ([Kivan and Kilic, 2006, 2005; Laumann et al., 2008](#page-7-0)). However, it should be pointed out that different host egg dimensions influence parasitoid body size and thus their longevity [\(Arakawa et al.,](#page-6-0) [2004; Bezemer et al., 2005; Jervis et al., 2007\)](#page-6-0).

The sex ratio was female biased for both parasitoid species as already reported in studies on *T. japonicus*, *T. mitsukurii*, and other *Trissolcus* species ([James and Warren, 1991; Kivan and Kilic, 2006, 2005; Lau](#page-7-0)[mann et al., 2008; Sabbatini Peverieri et al., 2020\)](#page-7-0). For both parasitoid species, more males emerged at 26 and 31 ◦C than at 16 and 21 ◦C, indicating that a high temperature can influence sex allocation in parasitoid wasps [\(Kivan and Kilic, 2006; Moiroux et al., 2014\)](#page-7-0). In our experiment, the sex ratio of both species was lower with respect to natural sex ratio observed by many authors ([Avila et al., 2021;](#page-6-0) [Kamiyama et al., 2021; Mele et al., 2022; Zhang et al., 2017\)](#page-6-0) but also with respect to other laboratory experiments (Sabbatini Peverieri et al., [2020\)](#page-7-0), possibly due to repeated oviposition that gradually led to a reduction in the female:male sex ratio ([Jervis et al., 2007\)](#page-7-0).

As already observed for other *Trissolcus* species, the progeny survival of both *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* is reduced with temperatures lower than 21 ◦C ([James and Warren, 1991; Kivan and Kilic, 2005, 2006](#page-7-0)). *Trissolcus japonicus* females demonstrated a higher fecundity with respect to *T. mitsukurii* at higher temperature. The number of eggs laid by *T. japonicus* increased with increasing temperature, while *T. mitsukurii* showed a different response to the temperature. The fecundity of *T. mitsukurii* increased from 16 to 26 ◦C but decreases at 31 ◦C, possibly because an increase in metabolic cost due to temperature could limit the fecundity of this species [\(Ellers et al., 2001; Mills, 1981](#page-6-0)). The optimum temperature range for oogenesis and oviposition generally varies between species and beyond this range insects cannot sustain both for an extended period ([Jervis et al., 2007\)](#page-7-0). The fecundity increases gradually with increasing temperature until it reaches a maximum level, above which the egg production falls down steeply due to an increase in metabolic costs [\(Bursell, 1974\)](#page-6-0). According to the results obtained here, *T. mitsukurii* reached maximum fecundity between 26 and 31 ◦C, while the maximum for *T. japonicus* seemed to be greater than or equal to 31 °C, suggesting better performances of the latter at higher temperatures.

Considering the results on the net reproductive rate, the growth rate of *T. japonicus* population is expected to be higher compared to *T. mitsukurii* during the summer period when average temperature

Fig. 3. Relationship between development rate (1/days) of *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* (egg to adult emergence) over temperature, described by the linear model and the Lactin-2 model.

ranges between 26 and 31 ◦C, while the differences for the population growth rate of the two species are expected to be low at lower temperature. Even though *T. japonicus* laid more eggs at 21 ◦C with respect to *T. mitsukurii*, the intrinsic rate of increase and the finite rate of increase of *T. mitsukurii* were higher than those of *T. japonicus*. This is probably due to a higher sex ratio for *T. mitsukurii* at 21 ◦C with respect to *T. japonicus* that counterbalanced the advantage given by the high fecundity. Also, the mean generation time and doubling time of *T. japonicus* were significantly higher than those of *T. mitsukurii*. These results suggest that when the average temperature is 21 ◦C, *T. mitsukurii* populations can grow faster than *T. japonicus* ones. However, the higher fecundity expressed at 26 and 31 ◦C by *T. japonicus* revealed a potentially higher capacity of parasitism at higher temperatures.

Even tough the intrinsic rate of increase of a parasitoid population is considered a realistic predictor of the parasitoid effectiveness ([Birch,](#page-6-0) [1948\)](#page-6-0), this should be coupled with the functional response based on searching efficiency, attack rate, and also phenological synchrony with the host ([Hassell, 2000](#page-6-0)). All these aspects should be taken into consideration when comparing the performances of the two species [\(Hochberg](#page-6-0) [and Holt, 1999; Kidd and Jervis, 2007\)](#page-6-0). Moreover, the interspecific competition between *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* in parasitizing *H. halys* could vary according to the environmental conditions, since temperature changes could affect the outcome of the competition [\(Costi](#page-6-0) [et al., 2022; Giovannini et al., 2022; Hance et al., 2007; Hassell, 2000](#page-6-0)). The higher intrinsic rate of increase of *T. mitsukurii* at lower temperature may indicate a faster population increase early in the season. A differential adaptation to temperature condition is also highlighted by the developmental thresholds. The minimum threshold for development of *Trissolcus mitsukurii* is about 1 ◦C lower than *T. japonicus*. On the contrary the maximum threshold for development is about 2 ◦C higher for *T. japonicus* than *T. mitsukurii*. All these aspects should be taken into account for the development of biological control programmes in invaded areas. In Italy, *H. halys* is known to develop two generations annually and starts to oviposit when mean temperatures are between 20 ◦C and 23 ◦C [\(Costi et al., 2017](#page-6-0)). Before the oviposition period of *H. halys*, *T. mitsukurii* likely parasitizes pentatomid species other than *H. halys* (e.g., *Nezara vididula*, *Eurydema* spp., *Dolycoris baccarum*, *Raphigaster nebulosa, Palomena prasina*) ([Angeli et al., 2021\)](#page-6-0), since it has a broader host range compared to *T. japonicus* ([Giovannini et al., 2021b;](#page-6-0) [Sabbatini-Peverieri et al., 2021](#page-6-0)). All in all, a *T. mitsukurii* population may have a faster increase with respect to *T. japonicus* at the beginning of the oviposition period of the *H. halys* overwintered generation, but *T. japonicus* population is expected to grow at higher levels then *T. mitsukurii* during the summer period, when *H. halys* lays more eggs ([Costi et al., 2017\)](#page-6-0).

Environmental factors play a key role in the distribution of the two parasitoid species in invaded areas. According to our results,

T. mitsukurii has higher performances at a lower temperature range compared to *T. japonicus* confirming the model predictions by [Tortorici](#page-8-0) [et al. \(2023\)](#page-8-0) that mapped a trend of *T. mitsukurii* to prefer higher latitudes with cooler climate compared to *T. japonicus*. Therefore, the coexistence of the two species in invaded areas depends on climate factors but also on searching efficiency because the first *Trissolcus* that reaches and exploits the egg mass is the one with the highest reproductive success [\(Costi et al., 2022; Giovannini et al., 2022\)](#page-6-0). Ideally, the coexistence could provide better control since the abundance of one or the other species could vary along with the growing season according to the climate. However, when parasitoids attack the same host stage, replacement is more probable and mainly driven by parasitoids population abundance and their searching efficiency [\(Hassell, 2000; Pedersen](#page-6-0) [and Mills, 2004\)](#page-6-0).

The impact of the increase in average temperatures due to climate warming is expected to be stronger on higher trophic levels, since the upper thermal limit of *H. halys* is 36.5 ◦C, which is actually higher than those of *T. japonicus* (35.2 ◦C) and *T. mitsukurii* (33.5 ◦C) ([Agosta et al.,](#page-6-0) [2018; Hance et al., 2007; Karl and Trenberth, 2003; Monticelli et al.,](#page-6-0) [2021\)](#page-6-0). The impact of increasing temperature is expected to be higher on *T. mitsukurii* than the other species. Moreover, divergence between thermal preferences of the host and those of parasitoids can lead to a temporal or geographical disruption of the synchronization, increasing the risk of pest outbreaks [\(Hance et al., 2007; Monticelli et al., 2021;](#page-6-0) [Tougeron and Tena, 2019](#page-6-0)). For this reason, the analysis of thermal preferences of biological control agents and how host-parasitoid systems react to changes in temperature can support the selection of biological control agents.

5. Conclusions

Biological control of *H. halys* with egg parasitoids is currently considered the most promising long-term solution against this pest. Exotic egg parasitoids are currently the most effective natural enemies for biological control of *H. halys* in the invaded areas. The two parasitoids considered here coexist in both native and introduced areas, but some differences in habitat suitability emerged using a modelling approach ([Tortorici et al., 2023](#page-8-0)). The present study shed light on these differences by investigating life table parameters of *T. japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii* under different temperatures. *Trissolcus japonicus* demonstrated higher performances as biological control agent with respect to *T. mitsukurii*. However, *T. mitsukurii* resulted as being better adapted to low temperature regimes. The results obtained here can be useful to predict the outcome of biological control programmes in locations with different thermal traits.

Funding

This work was supported by Regione Veneto – U.O. Fitosanitario – Direzione Agroambiente, Programmazione e Gestione ittica e faunisticovenatoria. The activities were performed in the framework of the program authorized and funded by Veneto region (DGR n. 611 19 May 2020) and the Italian biocontrol program against H. halys (decree of the Italian Ministry of the Environment, Land and Sea n.0042967 of 09/06/ 2020). This study was carried out within the Agritech National Research Center and received funding from the European Union Next-GenerationEU (PIANO NAZIONALE DI RIPRESA E RESILIENZA (PNRR) – MISSIONE 4 COMPONENTE 2, INVESTIMENTO 1.4 – D.D. 1032 17/06/ 2022, CN00000022). This manuscript reflects only the authors' views and opinions, neither the European Union nor the European Commission can be considered responsible for them.

CRediT authorship contribution statement

Alberto Mele: Writing – review & editing, Supervision, Project administration, Methodology, Funding acquisition, Conceptualization. **Dinvesh Sai Avanigadda:** Data curation, Investigation. **Enrico Ceccato:** Investigation, Data curation. **Gabriel Bamidele Olawuyi:** Data curation, Investigation. **Filippo Simoni:** Data curation, Investigation, Methodology. **Carlo Duso:** Conceptualization. **Davide Scaccini:** Writing – review & editing, Methodology, Conceptualization. **Alberto Pozzebon:** Writing – review & editing, Supervision, Project administration, Methodology, Funding acquisition, Conceptualization.

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2024.105548) [org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2024.105548](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2024.105548).

References

- Abram, P.K., Talamas, E.J., Acheampong, S., Mason, P.G., Gariepy, T.D., 2019. First detection of the samurai wasp, *Trissolcus japonicus* (Ashmead) (Hymenoptera, Scelionidae), Canada. J. Hymenopt. Res. 68, 29-36. https://doi.org/10.3897 [jhr.68.32203](https://doi.org/10.3897/jhr.68.32203).
- Agosta, S.J., Joshi, K.A., Kester, K.M., 2018. Upper thermal limits differ among and within component species in a tritrophic host-parasitoid-hyperparasitoid system. PLoS One 13, e0198803. [https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0198803.](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0198803)
- Angeli, G., Borri, G., Chiesa, S.G., Chini, L., Gallimbeni, L., Marchesini, A., Sofia, M., Fellin, L., Mazzoni, V., Mottes, R., Zapponi, L., Anfora, G., 2021. Cimici, guida al riconoscimento delle specie di interesse agrario nel Nord Italia.
- Arakawa, R., Miura, M., Fujita, M., 2004. Effects of host species on the body size, fecundity, and longevity of *Trissolcus mitsukurii* (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae), a solitary egg parasitoid of stink bugs. Appl. Entomol. Zool. 39, 177–181. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1303/aez.2004.177) [org/10.1303/aez.2004.177](https://doi.org/10.1303/aez.2004.177).
- Avila, G.A., Chen, J.-H., Li, W., Alavi, M., Mi, Q., Sandanayaka, M., Zhang, F., Zhang, J., 2021. Seasonal abundance and diversity of egg parasitoids of *Halyomorpha halys* in kiwifruit orchards in China. Insects 12, 428. https://doi.org/10.3 [insects12050428](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects12050428).
- Bellows, T.S., Van Driesche, R.G., Elkinton, J.S., 1992. Life-table construction and analysis in the evaluation of natural enemies. Annu. Rev. Entomol. 37, 587–612. [https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.en.37.010192.003103.](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.en.37.010192.003103)
- Bezemer, T.M., Harvey, J.A., Mills, N.J., 2005. Influence of adult nutrition on the relationship between body size and reproductive parameters in a parasitoid wasp. Ecol. Entomol. 30, 571–580. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0307-6946.2005.00726.x.](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0307-6946.2005.00726.x) Birch, L.C., 1948. The intrinsic rate of natural increase of an insect population. J. Anim.
- Ecol. 17, 15 <https://doi.org/10.2307/1605>. Bittau, B., Dindo, M.L., Burgio, G., Sabbatini-Peverieri, G., Hoelmer, K.A., Roversi, P.F., Masetti, A., 2021. Implementing mass rearing of *Trissolcus japonicus* (Hymenoptera:
- Scelionidae) on cold-stored host eggs. Insects 12, 840. [https://doi.org/10.3390/](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects12090840) [insects12090840](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects12090840).
- Bosco, L., Moraglio, S.T., Tavella, L., 2018. *Halyomorpha halys*, a serious threat for hazelnut in newly invaded areas. J. Pest. Sci. 91, 661–670. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-017-0937-x) s10340-017-0937-
- Bout, A., Tortorici, F., Hamidi, R., Warot, S., Tavella, L., Thomas, M., 2021. First detection of the adventive egg parasitoid of *Halyomorpha halys* (Stål) (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) *Trissolcus mitsukurii* (Ashmead) (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae) in France. Insects 12, 761. https://doi.org/10.3390/insects120907
- Bursell, E., 1974. Enviromental aspects temperature. In: The Physiology of Insecta. Elsevier, pp. 1–41. doi: 10.1016/B978-0-12-591602-8.50008-4.
- Campbell, A., Frazer, B.D., Gilbert, N., Gutierrez, A.P., Mackauer, M., 1974. Temperature requirements of some aphids and their parasites. J. Appl. Ecol. 11, 431 [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.2307/2402197) [org/10.2307/2402197.](https://doi.org/10.2307/2402197)
- Carey, J.R., 2001. Insect biodemography. Annu. Rev. Entomol. 46, 79–110. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ento.46.1.79) [org/10.1146/annurev.ento.46.1.79.](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ento.46.1.79)
- Carey, J.R., 1993. Applied Demography for Biologists. Oxford University Press, New York, NY. doi: 10.1093/oso/9780195066876.001.0001.
- Cissel, W.J., Mason, C.E., Whalen, J., Hough-Goldstein, J., Hooks, C.R.R., 2015. Effects of Brown Marmorated Stink Bug (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) feeding injury on sweet corn yield and quality. J. Econ. Entomol. 108, 1065–1071. [https://doi.org/10.1093/](https://doi.org/10.1093/jee/tov059) ee/tov059.
- Costi, E., Haye, T., Maistrello, L., 2017. Biological parameters of the invasive brown marmorated stink bug, *Halyomorpha halys*, in southern Europe. J. Pest. Sci. 90, 1059–1067. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-017-0899-z.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-017-0899-z)
- Costi, E., Di Bella, E., Iotti, D., Maistrello, L., 2022. Biocontrol implications of multiparasitism by *Trissolcus mitsukurii* and *Trissolcus japonicus* on the invasive brown marmorated stink bug. Entomol. Exp. Appl. 170, 772–781. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1111/eea.13185) [10.1111/eea.13185](https://doi.org/10.1111/eea.13185).
- Dieckhoff, C., Wenz, S., Renninger, M., Reißig, A., Rauleder, H., Zebitz, C.P.W., Reetz, J., Zimmermann, O., 2021. Add Germany to the list—adventive population of *Trissolcus japonicus* (Ashmead) (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae) emerges in Germany. Insects 12, 414. [https://doi.org/10.3390/insects12050414.](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects12050414)
- Ellers, J., Bax, M., Van Alphen, J.J.M., 2001. Seasonal changes in female size and its relation to reproduction in the parasitoid *Asobara tabida*. Oikos 92, 209–314. <https://doi.org/10.1034/j.1600-0706.2001.920213.x>.
- [Faúndez, E.I., Rider, D.A., 2017. The brown marmorated stink bug](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0105) *Halyomorpha halys* (Stål, 1855) (Heteroptera: Pentatomidae) in Chile. Arq. Entomolóxicos 17, 305-307.
- [Fogain, R., Graff, S., 2011. First records of the invasive pest,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0110) *Halyomorpha halys* [\(Hemiptera : Pentatomidae\), in Ontario and Quebec. J. Entomol. Soc. Ontario 142,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0110) 45–[48](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0110).
- Fornasiero, D., Scaccini, D., Lombardo, V., Galli, G., Pozzebon, A., 2023. Effect of exclusion net timing of deployment and color on *Halyomorpha halys* (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) infestation in pear and apple orchards. Crop Prot. 172, 106331 [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cropro.2023.106331.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cropro.2023.106331)
- Francati, S., Masetti, A., Martinelli, R., Mirandola, D., Anteghini, G., Busi, R., Dalmonte, F., Spinelli, F., Burgio, G., Dindo, M.L., 2021. *Halyomorpha halys* (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) on kiwifruit in northern Italy: phenology, infestation, and natural enemies assessment. J. Econ. Entomol. 1–10. [https://doi.org/10.1093/](https://doi.org/10.1093/jee/toab126) [jee/toab126.](https://doi.org/10.1093/jee/toab126)
- Furlong, M.J., Zalucki, M.P., 2017. Climate change and biological control: the consequences of increasing temperatures on host–parasitoid interactions. Curr. Opin. Insect Sci. 20, 39–44. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cois.2017.03.006.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cois.2017.03.006)
- Gariepy, T.D., Talamas, E.J., 2019. Discovery of *Trissolcus japonicus* (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae) in Ontario, Canada. Can. Entomol. 151, 824–826. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.4039/tce.2019.58) [10.4039/tce.2019.58](https://doi.org/10.4039/tce.2019.58).
- Giovannini, L., Sabbatini-Peverieri, G., Marianelli, L., Rondoni, G., Conti, E., Roversi, P. F., 2021a. Physiological host range of *Trissolcus mitsukurii*, a candidate biological control agent of *Halyomorpha halys* in Europe. J. Pest. Sci. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-021-01415-x) [s10340-021-01415-x](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-021-01415-x).
- Giovannini, L., Sabbatini-Peverieri, G., Tillman, P.G., Hoelmer, K.A., Roversi, P.F., 2021b. Reproductive and developmental biology of *Acroclisoides sinicus*, a hyperparasitoid of Scelionid parasitoids. Biology (Basel) 10, 229. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.3390/biology10030229) [10.3390/biology10030229.](https://doi.org/10.3390/biology10030229)
- Giovannini, L., Sabbatini-Peverieri, G., Simoni, S., Cervo, R., Hoelmer, K.A., Roversi, P. F., 2022. Interspecific competition between *Trissolcus japonicus* and *Trissolcus mitsukurii*, two promising candidates for biocontrol of *Halyomorpha halys*. Biol. Control 176, 105068. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2022.105068.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2022.105068)
- Gutierrez, A.P., Sabbatini Peverieri, G., Ponti, L., Giovannini, L., Roversi, P.F., Mele, A., Pozzebon, A., Scaccini, D., Hoelmer, K.A., 2023. Tritrophic analysis of the prospective biological control of brown marmorated stink bug, *Halyomorpha halys*, under extant weather and climate change. J. Pest. Sci. 96, 921-942. https://doi.org/ [10.1007/s10340-023-01610-y.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-023-01610-y)
- Hance, T., van Baaren, J., Vernon, P., Boivin, G., 2007. Impact of extreme temperatures on parasitoids in a climate change perspective. Annu. Rev. Entomol. 52, 107–126. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ento.52.110405.091333>.
- Hassell, M.P., 2000. The Spatial and Temporal Dynamics of Host–Parasitoid Interactions. Oxford University Press, Oxford. doi: 10.1093/oso/9780198540892.001.0001.
- Haye, T., Moraglio, S.T., Stahl, J., Visentin, S., Gregorio, T., Tavella, L., 2020. Fundamental host range of *Trissolcus japonicus* in Europe. J. Pest. Sci. 93, 171–182. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-019-01127-3>.
- Hedstrom, C., Lowenstein, D., Andrews, H., Bai, B., Wiman, N., 2017. Pentatomid host suitability and the discovery of introduced populations of *Trissolcus japonicus* in Oregon. J. Pest. Sci. 90, 1169–1179. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-017-0892-6.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-017-0892-6)
- [Hochberg, M.E., Holt, R.D., 1999. The uniformity and density of pest exploitation as](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0175) [guides to success in biological control. In: Cornell, H.V., Hawkins, B.A. \(Eds.\),](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0175) [Theoretical Approaches to Biological Control. Cambridge University Press,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0175) [Cambridge, UK, pp. 71](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0175)–85.

A. Mele et al.

[Hoebeke, E.R., Carter, M.E., 2003.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0180) *Halyomorpha halys* (Stål) (Heteroptera: [Pentatomidae\): a polyphagous plant pest from Asia newly detected in North](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0180) [America. Proc. Entomol. Soc. Washingt. 105, 225](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0180)–237.

Ikemoto, T., Takai, K., 2000. A new linearized formula for the law of total effective temperature and the evaluation of line-fitting methods with both variables subject to error. Environ. Entomol. 29, 671–682. [https://doi.org/10.1603/0046-225X-](https://doi.org/10.1603/0046-225X-29.4.671)

- [29.4.671.](https://doi.org/10.1603/0046-225X-29.4.671) James, D.G., Warren, G.N., 1991. Effect of temperature on development, survival, longevity and fecundity of *Trissolcus oenone* Dodd (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae). Aust. J. Entomol. 30, 303–306. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1440-6055.1991.tb00441.x.](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1440-6055.1991.tb00441.x)
- Jeffs, C.T., Lewis, O.T., 2013. Effects of climate warming on host-parasitoid interactions. Ecol. Entomol. 38, 209–218. <https://doi.org/10.1111/een.12026>.
- Jervis, M.A., Copland, M.J.W., Harvey, J.A., 2007. The life-cycle. In: Insects As Natural Enemies. Springer Netherlands, Dordrecht, pp. 73–165. doi: 10.1007/978-1-4020- 2625-6_2.
- Kamiyama, M.T., Matsuura, K., Hata, T., Yoshimura, T., Yang, C.-C.-S., 2021. Seasonal parasitism of native egg parasitoids of brown marmorated stink bug (*Halyomorpha halys*) in Japan. J. Pest. Sci. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-021-01455-3.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-021-01455-3)
- Karl, T.R., Trenberth, K.E., 2003. Modern global climate change. Science 302, 1719–1723.<https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1090228>.
- Kaser, J.M., Akotsen-Mensah, C., Talamas, E.J., Nielsen, A.L., 2018. First report of *Trissolcus japonicus* parasitizing *Halyomorpha halys* in North American agriculture. Florida Entomol. 101, 680 <https://doi.org/10.1653/024.101.0406>.
- Kidd, N.A.C., Jervis, M.A., 2007. Population dynamics. In: Insects as Natural Enemies. Springer, Netherlands, Dordrecht, pp. 435–523. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4020-2625-6_7) [4020-2625-6_7.](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4020-2625-6_7)
- Kivan, M., Kilic, N., 2005. Effects of temperature on reproductive capacity and longevity of *Trissolcus simoni*, an egg parasitoid of *Eurygaster integriceps*. J. Pest. Sci. 78, 105–108. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-004-0075-0>.
- Kivan, M., Kilic, N., 2006. Age-specific fecundity and life table of *Trissolcus semistriatus*, an egg parasitoid of the sunn pest *Eurygaster integriceps*. Entomol. Sci. 9, 39–46. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1479-8298.2006.00152.x.](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1479-8298.2006.00152.x)
- Klapwijk, M.J., Gröbler, B.C., Ward, K., Wheeler, D., Lewis, O.T., 2010. Influence of experimental warming and shading on host-parasitoid synchrony. Glob. Chang. Biol. 16, 102–112.<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2009.01918.x>.
- Kuhar, T.P., Kamminga, K., 2017. Review of the chemical control research on *Halyomorpha halys* in the USA. J. Pest. Sci. 90, 1021–1031. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-017-0859-7) [s10340-017-0859-7.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-017-0859-7)
- Lactin, D.J., Holliday, N.J., Johnson, D.L., Craigen, R., 1995. Improved rate model of temperature-dependent development by arthropods. Environ. Entomol. 24, 68–75. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ee/24.1.68>.
- Laterza, I., Sabree, Z.L., Martinez-Sañudo, I., Scaccini, D., Pozzebon, A., Cornara, D., de Lillo, E., Tamburini, G., 2023. *Halyomorpha halys* in Mediterranean areas: local and landscape predictors, genetic diversity, and potential biological control. Entomol. Gen. 43, 981–990.<https://doi.org/10.1127/entomologia/2023/2032>.
- Laumann, R.A., Moraes, M.C.B., Pareja, M., Alarcão, G.C., Botelho, A.C., Maia, A.H.N., Leonardecz, E., Borges, M., 2008. Comparative biology and functional response of *Trissolcus* spp. (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae) and implications for stink bugs (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) biological control. Biol. Control 44, 32–41. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2007.10.003) [org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2007.10.003.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2007.10.003)
- Lee, D.-H., Short, B.D., Joseph, S.V., Bergh, J.C., Leskey, T.C., 2013. Review of the biology, ecology, and management of *Halyomorpha halys* (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) in China, Japan, and the Republic of Korea. Environ. Entomol. 42, 627–641. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1603/EN13006) [doi.org/10.1603/EN13006.](https://doi.org/10.1603/EN13006)
- Leskey, T.C., Nielsen, A.L., 2018. Impact of the invasive Brown Marmorated Stink Bug in north America and Europe: history, biology, ecology, and management. Annu. Rev. Entomol. 63, 599–618. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-ento-020117-043226>.
- Maia, A.D.H.N., Luiz, A.J.B., Campanhola, C., 2000. Statistical inference on associated fertility life table parameters using jackknife technique: computational aspects. J. Econ. Entomol. 93, 511–518. <https://doi.org/10.1603/0022-0493-93.2.511>.
- Maistrello, L., Vaccari, G., Caruso, S., Costi, E., Bortolini, S., Macavei, L., Foca, G., Ulrici, A., Bortolotti, P.P., Nannini, R., Casoli, L., Fornaciari, M., Mazzoli, G.L., Dioli, P., 2017. Monitoring of the invasive *Halyomorpha halys*, a new key pest of fruit orchards in northern Italy. J. Pest. Sci. 90, 1231-1244. https://doi.org [s10340-017-0896-2.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-017-0896-2)
- Malek, R., Kaser, J.M., Anfora, G., Ciolli, M., Khrimian, A., Weber, D.C., Hoelmer, K.A., 2021. *Trissolcus japonicus* foraging behavior: Implications for host preference and classical biological control. Biol. Control 161, 104700. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2021.104700) [biocontrol.2021.104700](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2021.104700).
- McIntosh, H.R., Skillman, V.P., Galindo, G., Lee, J.C., 2020. Floral resources for *Trissolcus japonicus*, a parasitoid of *Halyomorpha halys*. Insects 11, 413. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects11070413) [10.3390/insects11070413.](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects11070413)
- Mele, A., Scaccini, D., Pozzebon, A., 2021. Hyperparasitism of *Acroclisoides sinicus* (Huang and Liao) (Hymenoptera: Pteromalidae) on two Biological Control Agents of *Halyomorpha halys*. Insects 12, 617. <https://doi.org/10.3390/insects12070617>.
- Mele, A., Scaccini, D., Zanolli, P., Pozzebon, A., 2022. Semi-natural habitats promote biological control of *Halyomorpha halys* (Stål) by the egg parasitoid *Trissolcus mitsukurii* (Ashmead). Biol. Control 166, 104833. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2021.104833) [biocontrol.2021.104833](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2021.104833).
- Meyer, J.S., Ingersoll, C.G., McDonald, L.L., Boyce, M.S., 1986. Estimating uncertainty in population growth rates: jackknife vs. bootstrap techniques. Ecology 67, 1156–1166. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1938671>.
- Mills, N.J., 1981. Some aspects of the rate of increase of a coccinellid. Ecol. Entomol. 6, 293–299. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2311.1981.tb00616.x.](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2311.1981.tb00616.x)
- Moiroux, J., Brodeur, J., Boivin, G., 2014. Sex ratio variations with temperature in an egg parasitoid: behavioural adjustment and physiological constraint. Anim. Behav. 91, 61–66. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.anbehav.2014.02.021.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.anbehav.2014.02.021)
- Monticelli, L.S., Bishop, J., Desneux, N., Gurr, G.M., Jaworski, C.C., McLean, A.H.C., Thomine, E., Vanbergen, A.J., 2021. Multiple global change impacts on parasitism and biocontrol services in future agricultural landscapes. In: Advances in Ecological Research. Elsevier Ltd., pp. 245-304. https://doi.org/10.1016/bs.aecr.
- Moore, L., Tirello, P., Scaccini, D., Toews, M.D., Duso, C., Pozzebon, A., 2019. Characterizing damage potential of the brown marmorated stink bug in cherry orchards in Italy. Entomol. Gen. 39, 271–283. [https://doi.org/10.1127/](https://doi.org/10.1127/entomologia/2019/0799) [entomologia/2019/0799.](https://doi.org/10.1127/entomologia/2019/0799)
- Moraglio, S.T., Tortorici, F., Pansa, M.G., Castelli, G., Pontini, M., Scovero, S., Visentin, S., Tavella, L., 2020. A 3-year survey on parasitism of *Halyomorpha halys* by egg parasitoids in northern Italy. J. Pest. Sci. 93, 183–194. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-019-01136-2) [s10340-019-01136-2](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-019-01136-2).
- Nielsen, A.L., Hamilton, G.C., Shearer, P.W., 2011. Seasonal phenology and monitoring of the non-native *Halyomorpha halys* (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) in soybean. Environ. Entomol. 40, 231–238. <https://doi.org/10.1603/EN10187>.
- Orr, D.B., 1988. Scelionid wasps as biological control agents: a review. Florida Entomol. 71, 506 <https://doi.org/10.2307/3495011>.
- Park, Y., Choi, K., Cullum, J., Hoelmer, K.A., Weber, D.C., Morrison, W.R., Rice, K.B., Krawczyk, G., Fleischer, S.J., Hamilton, G., Ludwick, D., Nielsen, A.L., Kaser, J., Polk, D., Shrewsbury, P.M., Bergh, J.C., Kuhar, T.P., Leskey, T.C., 2023. Landscapescale spatiotemporal dynamics of *Halyomorpha halys* (Stål) (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) populations: implications for spatially-based pest management. Pest Manag. Sci. [https://doi.org/10.1002/ps.7772.](https://doi.org/10.1002/ps.7772)
- Pedersen, B.S., Mills, N.J., 2004. Single vs. multiple introduction in biological control: the roles of parasitoid efficiency, antagonism and niche overlap. J. Appl. Ecol. 41, 973–984. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0021-8901.2004.00953.x>.
- [R Core Team, 2021. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R A Lang.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/optk4hR3YHMXD) [Environ. Stat. Comput. R Found. Stat. Comput.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/optk4hR3YHMXD)
- Rebaudo, F., Struelens, Q., Dangles, O., 2018. Modelling temperature-dependent development rate and phenology in arthropods: the devRate package for R. Methods Ecol. Evol. 9, 1144–1150. [https://doi.org/10.1111/2041-210X.12935.](https://doi.org/10.1111/2041-210X.12935)
- Rondoni, G., Chierici, E., Giovannini, L., Sabbatini-Peverieri, G., Roversi, P.F., Conti, E., 2022. Olfactory responses of *Trissolcus mitsukurii* to plants attacked by target and non-target stink bugs suggest low risk for biological control. Sci. Rep. 12, 1880 [https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-022-05873-w.](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-022-05873-w)
- Rot, M., Maistrello, L., Costi, E., Bernardinelli, I., Malossini, G., Benvenuto, L., Trdan, S., 2021. Native and non-native egg parasitoids associated with Brown Marmorated Stink Bug (*Halyomorpha halys* [Stål, 1855]; Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) in western Slovenia. Insects 12, 505. [https://doi.org/10.3390/insects12060505.](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects12060505)
- Sabbatini Peverieri, G., Talamas, E., Bon, M.C., Marianelli, L., Bernardinelli, I., Malossini, G., Benvenuto, L., Roversi, P.F., Hoelmer, K., 2018. Two Asian egg parasitoids of *Halyomorpha halys* (Stål) (Hemiptera, Pentatomidae) emerge in northern Italy: *Trissolcus mitsukurii* (Ashmead) and *Trissolcus japonicus* (Ashmead) (Hymenoptera, Scelionidae). J. Hymenopt. Res. 67, 37–53. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.3897/jhr.67.30883) [10.3897/jhr.67.30883.](https://doi.org/10.3897/jhr.67.30883)
- Sabbatini Peverieri, G., Mitroiu, M.-D., Bon, M.-C., Balusu, R., Benvenuto, L., Bernardinelli, I., Fadamiro, H., Falagiarda, M., Fusu, L., Grove, E., Haye, T., Hoelmer, K., Lemke, E., Malossini, G., Marianelli, L., Moore, M.R., Pozzebon, A., Roversi, P.-F., Scaccini, D., Shrewsbury, P., Tillman, G., Tirello, P., Waterworth, R., Talamas, E.J., 2019. Surveys of stink bug egg parasitism in Asia, Europe and North America, morphological taxonomy, and molecular analysis reveal the Holarctic distribution of *Acroclisoides sinicus* (Huang & Liao) (Hymenoptera, Pteromalidae). J. Hymenopt. Res. 74, 123–151. [https://doi.org/10.3897/jhr.74.46701.](https://doi.org/10.3897/jhr.74.46701)
- Sabbatini Peverieri, G., Dieckhoff, C., Giovannini, L., Marianelli, L., Roversi, P.F., Hoelmer, K., 2020. Rearing *Trissolcus japonicus* and *Trissolcus mitsukurii* for biological control of *Halyomorpha halys*. Insects 11, 1–15. [https://doi.org/10.3390/](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects11110787) [insects11110787](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects11110787).
- Sabbatini-Peverieri, G., Boncompagni, L., Mazza, G., Paoli, F., Dapporto, L., Giovannini, L., Marianelli, L., Hoelmer, K., Roversi, P.F., 2021. Combining physiological host range, behavior and host characteristics for predictive risk analysis of *Trissolcus japonicus*. J. Pest. Sci. 94, 1003–1016. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-020-01311-w) [s10340-020-01311-w.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-020-01311-w)
- SAS Institute Inc., 2016. PROC User's Manual, 6th ed.; SAS Institute: Cary, NC, USA. Available online: [http://support.sas.com/documentation/cdl/en/indbug](http://support.sas.com/documentation/cdl/en/indbug/68442/PDF/default/indbug.pdf) [/68442/PDF/default/indbug.pdf](http://support.sas.com/documentation/cdl/en/indbug/68442/PDF/default/indbug.pdf) (accessed on 15 March 2021).
- Scaccini, D., Pozzebon, A., 2021. Invasive brown marmorated stink bug (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) facilitates feeding of European wasps and ants (Hymenoptera: Vespidae, Formicidae) on plant exudates. Eur. J. Entomol. 118, 24–30. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.14411/eje.2021.003) [org/10.14411/eje.2021.003.](https://doi.org/10.14411/eje.2021.003)
- Scaccini, D., Falagiarda, M., Tortorici, F., Martinez-Sañudo, I., Tirello, P., Reyes-Domínguez, Y., Gallmetzer, A., Tavella, L., Zandigiacomo, P., Duso, C., Pozzebon, A., 2020. An insight into the role of *Trissolcus mitsukurii* as biological control agent of *Halyomorpha halys* in northeastern Italy. Insects 11, 1–16. [https://doi.org/10.3390/](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects11050306) [insects11050306](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects11050306).
- Scala, M., Fouani, J.M., Zapponi, L., Mazzoni, V., Wells, K.E., Biondi, A., Baser, N., Verrastro, V., Anfora, G., 2022. Attraction of egg parasitoids *Trissolcus mitsukurii* and *Trissolcus japonicus* to the chemical cues of *Halyomorpha halys* and *Nezara viridula*. Insects 13, 439. [https://doi.org/10.3390/insects13050439.](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects13050439)
- Stahl, J.M., Scaccini, D., Pozzebon, A., Daane, K.M., 2020. Comparing the feeding damage of the invasive Brown Marmorated Stink Bug to a native stink bug and Leaffooted Bug on California pistachios. Insects 11, 688. [https://doi.org/10.3390/](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects11100688) [insects11100688](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects11100688).
- Stahl, J.M., Scaccini, D., Daane, K.M., 2021. Field survival of the Brown Marmorated Stink Bug *Halyomorpha halys* (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) on California tree crops. Environ. Entomol. 50, 1187–1193. [https://doi.org/10.1093/ee/nvab055.](https://doi.org/10.1093/ee/nvab055)
- Stahl, J., Tortorici, F., Pontini, M., Bon, M.-C., Hoelmer, K., Marazzi, C., Tavella, L., Haye, T., 2019. First discovery of adventive populations of *Trissolcus japonicus* in Europe. J. Pest. Sci. 92, 371–379. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-018-1061-2.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-018-1061-2)
- Talamas, E.J., Herlihy, M.V., Dieckhoff, C., Hoelmer, K.A., Buffington, M., Bon, M.-C., Weber, D.C., 2015. *Trissolcus japonicus* (Ashmead) (Hymenoptera, Scelionidae) emerges in North America. J. Hymenopt. Res. 43, 119-128. https://doi.org/ [10.3897/JHR.43.4661](https://doi.org/10.3897/JHR.43.4661).
- Tamburini, G., Laterza, I., Nardi, D., Mele, A., Mori, N., Pasini, M., Scaccini, D., Pozzebon, A., Marini, L., 2023. Effect of landscape composition on the invasive pest *Halyomorpha halys* in fruit orchards. Agr. Ecosyst. Environ. 353, 108530 [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2023.108530) [org/10.1016/j.agee.2023.108530](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2023.108530).
- Tortorici, F., Bombi, P., Loru, L., Mele, A., Moraglio, S.T., Scaccini, D., Pozzebon, A., Pantaleoni, R.A., Tavella, L., 2023. *Halyomorpha halys* and its egg parasitoids *Trissolcus japonicus* and *T. mitsukurii*: the geographic dimension of the interaction. NeoBiota 85, 197–221. [https://doi.org/10.3897/neobiota.85.102501.](https://doi.org/10.3897/neobiota.85.102501)
- Tougeron, K., Tena, A., 2019. Hyperparasitoids as new targets in biological control in a global change context. Biol. Control 130, 164–171. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2018.09.003) [biocontrol.2018.09.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2018.09.003).
- Van Driesche, R.G., Bellows, T.S., 1996. Biology of arthropod parasitoids and predators. In: Biological Control. Springer US, Boston, MA, pp. 309–336. doi: 10.1007/978-1- 4613-1157-7_15.
- [Wermelinger, B., Wyniger, D., Forster, B., 2008. First records of an invasive bug in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0440) Europe: *Halyomorpha halys* [Stål \(Heteroptera: Pentatomidae\), a new pest on woody](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0440) [ornamentals and fruit trees? Bull. La Soci](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S1049-9644(24)00113-0/h0440)été Entomol. Suisse 81, 1-8.
- Wong, W.H.L., Walz, M.A., Oscienny, A.B., Sherwood, J.L., Abram, P.K., 2021. An effective cold storage method for stockpiling *Halyomorpha halys* (Hemiptera: Pentatomidae) eggs for field surveys and laboratory rearing of *Trissolcus japonicus* (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae). J. Econ. Entomol. 114, 571–581. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1093/jee/toaa307) [10.1093/jee/toaa307](https://doi.org/10.1093/jee/toaa307).
- Zapponi, L., Tortorici, F., Anfora, G., Bardella, S., Bariselli, M., Benvenuto, L., Bernardinelli, I., Butturini, A., Caruso, S., Colla, R., Costi, E., Culatti, P., Di Bella, E., Falagiarda, M., Giovannini, L., Haye, T., Maistrello, L., Malossini, G., Marazzi, C., Marianelli, L., Mele, A., Michelon, L., Moraglio, S.T., Pozzebon, A., Preti, M., Salvetti, M., Scaccini, D., Schmidt, S., Szalatnay, D., Roversi, P.F., Tavella, L., Tommasini, M.G., Vaccari, G., Zandigiacomo, P., Sabbatini-Peverieri, G., 2021. Assessing the distribution of exotic egg parasitoids of *Halyomorpha halys* in Europe with a large-scale monitoring program. Insects 12, 316. https://doi.org/10.339 [insects12040316](https://doi.org/10.3390/insects12040316).
- Zhang, J., Zhang, F., Gariepy, T., Mason, P., Gillespie, D., Talamas, E., Haye, T., 2017. Seasonal parasitism and host specificity of *Trissolcus japonicus* in northern China. J. Pest. Sci. 90, 1127–1141. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-017-0863-y.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-017-0863-y)